

**EVALUATION REPORT**  
**(As Per Rule, 35 of PP Rules, 2004)**

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Karachi Infrastructure Development Company Ltd (KIDCL), Ministry of Communications, Government of Pakistan.
2. Method of Procurement: Quality and Cost Based Selection, under Procurement of Consultancy services Regulations 2010, under Public Procurement Rules 2004
3. Title of Procurement: FEASIBILITY & TECHNICAL STUDY AND PRELIMINARY DESIGN FOR INTEGRATED INTELLIGENT TRANSPORT SYSTEM (IITS) FOR THE KARACHI MASS TRANSIT PLAN (ALL MRT/BRT LINES UNDER JICA KTIP STUDY)
4. Tender Inquiry No: CONTRACT PACKAGE # KAR/BRTS/IITS 01
5. PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS256885E
6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: 30<sup>th</sup> November, 2015, 1100 Hrs
7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 30<sup>th</sup> November, 2015, 1200 Hrs
8. No. of Bid Received: Two (02)-As mentioned below in para 10
9. Criteria for Bid Evaluation. Evaluation criteria already provided in the RFP. QCBS method for evaluation was followed, with weightage for quality and cost as 0.8 and 0.2 respectively. Evaluation criterion is reproduced below for reference:

S. No.	Description/Items	Max. Marks	
i.	Firm's Experience	<b>350</b>	
	General Experience (Minimum of 10 Years) in the field of Technology for Transportation networks / IT / ITS		100
	-10 years experience -10% increment of each additional year of experience.	50% 100% max	
	Specific Experience of IITS for Mass/Rapid Transit System in at least one similar project completed i.e. for integrated BRTS + Rail networks.		250
	Similarity of experience would be determined on the basis of similar or near similar complexity of network, integration aspects, and inter-operability as that envisaged for this assignment vis-à-vis TOR under this RFP.		
	Completion certificates in case of foreign experience must be attested by their country's consulate in		

*Q. 172*

	<p>Pakistan. In case of national companies, to be attested by Notary Public.</p> <p>-One Similar Project 50%</p> <p>-Two Similar Projects 75%</p> <p>-Three or more similar projects 100%</p> <p>Note: In Case of JV is to be formed for the subject assignment and if the share of junior partner does not exceed 30% only the lead partner would be evaluated for the Specific Experience. In case the JV Share of junior partner exceeds 30%, evaluation of all partners will be evaluated proportionate to their share in the JV.</p>			
ii	<p><b>Approach &amp; Methodology (The prospective consultants, besides submitting a comprehensive approach &amp; methodology paper, would also be required to make a comprehensive presentation before the Evaluation Committee, on following aspects)</b></p> <p>- Understanding of objectives 60</p> <p>- Quality of Methodology 60</p> <p>- Innovativeness 50</p> <p>- Work Program 30</p> <p>- Facilities proposed for the assignment 20</p> <p>- Conciseness, Clarity, and Completeness in proposal preparation 20</p> <p>Note: The requisite Presentation to be made before the Committee should not change essence of the Approach &amp; Methodology submitted in the Technical Proposal.</p>			
iii.	<b>Personnel (Area of Expertise) Qualification and Competence of Key Proposed Staff</b>		280	<u>280</u>
iv.	<b>Present Commitment (Full marks for 3 or more similar projects; less than 3 to be marked proportionally)</b>			<u>50</u>
v.	<b>Past Performance of the Consultant in last three assignments of comparable scope. Full marks for three similar projects; Less than three to be marked proportionally.</b>			<u>80</u>
			<b>Total Marks</b>	<b>1000</b>

*Amir*

2/6

10. Detail of Bid(s) Evaluation: Bids were evaluated under Quality and Cost based Selection, as under

	Name of Proposers	Weighted Technical Score	Bid Price (PKR)	Evaluated Cost (PKR)	Financial Score	Final Secured Score (Technical & Financial)
1	M/s. BLIC,EA Consulting (Pvt) Ltd and Data Communication& Control (Pvt) Ltd (JV)	946.27/1000	253,446,600/=	248,165,139/=	99.311	856.327
2	M/s. Exponent Engineers (Pvt) Ltd, GSD+ and E & Y (JV)	814.59/1000	123,227,874/=	123,227,853/=	200.00	851.672

t

Lowest Evaluated Bidder: **M/s. BLIC GMBH Germany, M/s. EA Consulting Pvt. Ltd and M/s. Data Communication & Control Pvt. Ltd (JV).**

11. Any other additional/supporting information he procuring agency may like to share.

**Summary Cost of M/s. BLIC,EA Consulting (Pvt) Ltd and Data Communication& Control (Pvt) Ltd (JV)**

STAGE I & II		PROPOSER BID COST		ARITHMETIC CHECK CALCULATION	
SR: NO	DESCRIPTION	AMOUNT (Pak. Rs.)	AMOUNT (USD)	AMOUNT (Pak. Rs.)	AMOUNT (USD)
1	SALARY COST	12,300,000	524,552	12,300,000	524,553
2	DIRECT COST	34,480,000	109,340	34,480,000	109,340
	TOTAL	46,780,000	633,892	46,780,000	633,893
	Service Tax and Income Tax on USD Components @ 25%		158,473		158,473
	Service Tax and Income Tax on Local Components @ 15%	7,017,000			
	Service Tax and Income Tax on Local Components @ 14% (As per Government Regulations)			6,549,200	
	Grand Total OF STAGE-I & II	53,797,000	792,365	53,329,200	792,366
	<b>Grand Total In PKR: of Stage-I &amp; II</b> AS PER RFP THE FOREIGN CURRENCY RATE WILL BE CONSIDERED AT THE TIME OF SUBMISSION I,e 30th November 2015. the Rate of USD on this date is 105.40 So the dollar currency 792,366 X 105.40 = RS:				<b>PKR: 136,844,576/=</b>

*J. M. 2*

*3/6*

	83,515,376				
STAGE III					
	SALARY COST	62,130,000	41,876	62,130,000	41,876
	DIRECT COST	30,680,000		30,680,000	
	TOTAL	92,810,000	41,876	92,810,000	41,876
	Service Tax and Income Tax on USD Components @ 25%		10,469		10,469
	Service Tax and Income Tax on Local Components @ 15%	13,921,500			
	Service Tax and Income Tax on Local Components @ 14% (As per Government Regulations)			12,993,400	
	Grand Total OF STAGE-III	106,731,500	52,345	105,803,400	52,345
	<b>Grand Total In PKR: of Stage-III</b> AS PER RFP THE FOREIGN CURRENCY RATE WILL BE CONSIDERED AT THE TIME OF SUBMISSION I,e 30th November 2015. the Rate of USD on this date is 105.40 So the dollar currency 52,345 X 105.40 = RS: 5,517,163				<b>PKR: 111,320,563/=</b>
	Grand Total OF PROJECT		<b>PKR: 253,446,710/=</b>		<b>RS: 136,844,576 + 111,320,563 = 248,165,139/=</b>

**Summary Cost of M/s. Exponent Engineers (Pvt) Ltd, GSD+ and E & Y (JV)**

STAGE I & II		PROPOSER BID COST	ARITHMETIC CHECK CALCULATION
SR: NO	DESCRIPTION	AMOUNT (Pak. Rs.)	AMOUNT (Pak. Rs.)
1	SALARY COST	66,800,900	66,800,896
2	DIRECT COST	7,298,000	7,298,000
	TOTAL EXCLUDING TAX	74,098,900	74,098,896
3	Service Tax and Income Tax on local Components @ 14%	10,373,846	10,373,845
<b>Grand Total OF STAGE-I &amp; II</b>		<b>84,472,746</b>	<b>84,472,741</b>

*Fin.*

4/6

STAGE III			
1	SALARY COST	11,291,465	11,291,464
2	DIRECT COST	815,000	815,000
	TOTAL EXCLUDING TAX	12,106,465	12,106,464
3	Service Tax and Income Tax on local Components @ 14%	1,694,905	1,694,905
4	Cost for Task 8: ITS Supervision for 6 Months Including All Taxes	24,953,758	24,953,743
<b>Grand Total OF STAGE-III</b>		<b>38,755,118</b>	<b>38,755,112</b>
<b>Grand Total OF PROJECT</b>		RS: 84,472,746 + 38,755,118 = 123,227,874/=	RS: 84,472,741 + 38,755,122 = 123,227,853/=

Figure in Pak. Rs.	M/s. BLIC, EA Consulting (Pvt) Ltd and Data Communication and Control (Pvt) Ltd (JV)	M/s. Exponent Engineers (Pvt) Ltd, GSD + and E & Y (JV)
Stage-I & II Payment to be made By (KIDCL)	Rs. 136,844,576/=	Rs. 84,472,741/=
Stage-III Payment to be made By (GoS)	Rs. 111,320,563/=	* Rs. 123,227,853/=
		Rs. 38,755,122/=

12. The technical proposals of the bidders have been evaluated jointly by the Technical Committee on IITS comprising officials of both KIDCL, Ministry of Communications and Government of Sindh.

13. The Combined Evaluation Report in respect of the subject procurement was placed before the BOD in its 4th meeting on 19<sup>th</sup> January, 2016. The BOD referred the report to the Procurement Committee of the BOD, for review. In pursuance to the directives of the BOD, 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Procurement Committee of BOD was convened in Islamabad, on 27<sup>th</sup> January, 2016 to consider the Combined Evaluation Report in respect of Consultancy Services for Feasibility and Technical Study and Preliminary Design of Integrated Intelligent Transport System (IITS) for the Karachi Mass Transit Plan.

14. The Procurement Committee, after detailed deliberations, recommended to the BOD KIDCL as under:

- a. The procurement process conducted in respect of Integrated Intelligent Transportation System (IITS), by KIDCL, in collaboration

*Fin*

\* Typo-Error Corrected.

3/6

18/1/16

with GoS, appears fair and in line with Evaluation Criteria laid down in RFP and as per the best practices of public procurement;

- b. The technical scores as well as financial scores secured by both the proposers appears on merit and as per the evaluation criteria in the Request for Proposal;

Name of Proposers	Final Scores (out of 1000)	Evaluated Price (PKR)	Stage – I & II (KIDCL)	Stage – III (GoS)	Remarks
M/s: BLIC GMBH Germany & JV.	856.327	248,165,139/=	136.844 Millions	111.321 Millions	Highest Evaluated Bidder
M/s. Exponent Engineers & (JV)	851.672	123,227,853/=	84.472 Millions	38.755 Millions	2 <sup>nd</sup> Highest Evaluated Bidder

- c. The apparent difference in bidder's price is understandable vis-à-vis the technical merits, demonstrated experience and resources committed by the highest evaluated bidder i.e. M/s. BLIC GMBH Germany (Lead) & JV. However, the KIDCL have been advised to negotiate, in terms of clauses of RFP at the time of contract negotiations, removing redundant man-months' quote for home (Germany) and make tax adjustments as the services are to be paid in PKR, so as to arrive at a rationalized overall cost;

- d. KIDCL to place the aforesaid recommendations before the BOD, by circulation, for endorsement / approval of the Board of Directors. If approved by the Board, KIDCL would only then proceed to hoist the Evaluation Report in terms of Rule 35, Public Procurement Rules, 2004 on PPRA website and invite the highest ranked bidder for contract negotiations in terms of RFP.

15. Minutes of the 3rd Procurement Committee, duly signed by the members and circulated among all the Directors on 28.1.2016. In compliance, the agenda was put before the Directors in the 5<sup>th</sup> BOD meeting by circulation, on 2<sup>nd</sup> February, 2016; wherein the combined evaluation report along with recommendations of the Procurement Committee of the BOD were submitted for approval of the BOD, by circulation. The BOD has accorded approval to the Combined Evaluation Report and the Bid Evaluation Report is being hoisted on PPRA's website, in accordance with Public Procurement Rules, 2004.

Signature.....

Official Stamp  
GENERAL MANAGER (F&A)/C.F.O  
Karachi Infrastructure Development  
Company Limited (KIDCL)  
Government of Pakistan

6/6.