

**EVALUATION REPORT**  
**(As Per Rule 35, Public Procurement Rules, 2004)**

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Karachi Infrastructure Development Company Ltd. (KIDCL), Ministry of Communications, Government of Pakistan.
2. Method of Procurement: Single-Stage (One Envelope / Least Evaluated Cost) under Rule 36 (a) of Public Procurement Rules 2004.
3. Title of Procurement: Appointment of External Auditors for the year 2015 – 2016
4. Tender Inquiry No: N/A
5. PPRA Ref. No (TSE): TS258274E
6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2015, 1100 Hrs
7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2015, 1200 Hrs
8. No. of Bids Received: Two (02) – As mentioned below
9. Criteria for Bid Evaluation: Evaluation / Qualification criteria already provided in the bidding documents. Evaluation criterion is reproduced below for Reference.

**Evaluation / Qualification Criteria:**

KIDCL invites firms of Chartered Accountants for the external audit who will meet the following criteria:

- a. The firm should be registered with ICAP and have satisfactory QCR rating.
  - b. The name of the firm should be borne on the Panel A of auditors, as maintained by, of the State Bank of Pakistan.
  - c. The name of the firm should be borne on other elite panel of auditors in Pakistan preferably international as well.
  - d. Applicant firms should have at least 15 years' experience in undertaking such assignments.
  - e. The firm should be a member firm of Global Top Ten Accounting Network.
  - f. The firm should have a reasonable experience of auditing NPO/NGO and Public Sector Entities functioning under the PSE (Corporate Governance) Rules 2013;
  - g. The competing firms shall attach relevant documents or equivalence certificate to validate their eligibility vis-à-vis a-f above.
10. Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:

Out of the two bidders who obtained the Tender Documents, only one submitted sealed bid i-e M/s. Riaz Ahmed & Company; while M/s. BSM Chartered Accountants, though obtained Tender Document, it preferred not to submit the Tender. The two (02) firms who obtained Tender Documents are as per following details:

S.No.	Name of Bidders	Amount of PO / DD Number
1.	M/s. RSM Avais Hyder Liaquat Nauman, Chartered Accountants	Rs. 1,000/- vide PO No. 12395523 dated 19 <sup>th</sup> November, 2015
2.	M/s. Riaz Ahmad & Company, Chartered Accountants	Rs. 1,000/- vide PO No. 12315433 dated 20 <sup>th</sup> November, 2015

7.

Two bidders submitted Sealed Bids by / on the closing date:

1. M/s. BDO Ebrahim & Co.
2. M/s. Riaz Ahmad & Company

The Unqualified bidders and Reasons for failure to qualify is as follows:

Name of Bidder	Reasons for Failure to Qualify The Technical Proposals
M/s. BDO Ebrahim & Co.	M/s. BDO Ebrahim & Co. applied in response to the NIT floated on PPRA's website but neither purchased the Tender Document upon payment of Rs. 1,000/- nor submitted 2% Bid Security of the total bid value, payable in the form of PO / DD in the name of "Karachi Infrastructure Development Company Limited", therefore in terms of PPRA Rules 2004 the Bid was rejected.

Bids submitted by the bidders are as follows:

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost	Conditions / Additional Information	Rule/Regulation/SBD* /Policy/ Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004
	Technical (if applicable)	Financial (if applicable)	Combined Marks			
M/s. BDO Ebrahim & Co.	N/A (Single Stage / Lowest Cost)			PKR. 250,000/-	Excluding provincial sales tax levied at 6% and out of pocket expenses.	M/s Riaz Ahmad & Company selected on the basis of lowest evaluated cost and their bid found to be in accordance with the acceptable criteria as per Tender Document.
M/s. Riaz Ahmad & Company	N/A (Single Stage / Lowest Cost)			PKR. 600,000/-	Inclusive of all reimbursable expenses and taxes.	

Lowest Evaluated Bidder: **M/s Riaz Ahmed & Company, Chartered Accountants**

11. Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.

Companies Ordinance 1984, provides as follows:

*The first auditor or auditors of a company shall be appointed by the directors within sixty days of the date of incorporation of the company; and the auditor or auditors so appointed shall hold office until the conclusion of the first annual general meeting:*

Therefore, in view of the above, the progress on procurement process in respect of Appointment of External Auditors was placed before the Board for approval, in the 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting of Board of Directors KIDCL, held in Islamabad, on the 19<sup>th</sup> January, 2016.

The Board acknowledged the Open Competitive Process under Public Procurement Rules 2004 for appointment of First External Auditors of KIDCL and accordingly, the Board of Directors approved appointment of M/s. Riaz Ahmed & Co. Chartered Accountants as First Auditors of KIDCL, at a remuneration of Rs. 600,000/-, for the period June, 2015 – July, 2016.

Signature: .....

**COMPANY SECRETARY**

Karachi Infrastructure Development Co. Ltd. (KIDCL)

Official Stamp: **Ministry of Communications**  
**Government of Pakistan**